



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

but *nevertheless* Clearchus for certain reasons of his own (ὁρῶν κ.τ.λ. ἀκούων κ.τ.λ.) refused to do so.

The sentence in question is an involved one, as Xenophon virtually admits in repeating the subject ὁ Κλέαρχος. To allow for that, and to translate ὁμως so that it may appear adversative to the rather remote ἐβόα κ.τ.λ., I suggest *after all* instead of *nevertheless*.

The entire passage might then be rendered: "In the meanwhile Cyrus, who in person came riding past with Pigres the interpreter and three or four others, kept shouting out to Clearchus to lead his forces against the enemy's center, because the king was there. 'And if we are victorious here,' said he, 'all our labors are over.' But Clearchus, *because* he saw the mass formation in the center, and *because* he heard from Cyrus that the king was out beyond the Greek left wing—for the king was so superior in numbers that, although he commanded his own center, he was out beyond Cyrus' left wing—*well*, Clearchus was *after all* loath to withdraw the right wing from the river, for he feared lest he be surrounded on both flanks, and he made reply to Cyrus that he was taking care that all should be well."

JOHN M. BRIDGHAM

STATE NORMAL SCHOOL  
LA CROSSE, WISCONSIN

---

XENOPHON *Anabasis* i. 8. 13

This passage, commented on by Professor Charles Knapp in the *Classical Journal* for November last, reads as follows: ὁρῶν δὲ ὁ Κλέαρχος τὸ μέσον στίφος καὶ ἀκούων Κύρου ξέω ὄντα τοῦ εὐωνύμου βασιλεία, τοσοῦτον γὰρ πλήθει περὶ τὴν βασιλεὺς ὥστε μέσον τῶν ἑαυτοῦ ἔχων τοῦ Κύρου εὐωνύμου ξέω ἦν, ἀλλ' ὁμως ὁ Κλέαρχος οὐκ ἤθελεν ἀποσπᾶσαι ἀπὸ τοῦ ποταμοῦ τὸ δεξιὸν κέρας, φοβούμενος μὴ κυκλωθεῖν ἑκατέρωθεν, κ.τ.λ. Professor Knapp insists that the participles ὁρῶν and ἀκούων are not concessive in force, but, like φοβούμενος below, are causal. In order to support this view he even maintains that Xenophon is guilty of a "logical flaw." Now it is possible to point to passages in Xenophon in which the logic is faulty; so, e.g., in i. 8. 27. There are passages also in which recent editors insist on seeing faulty grammar, as, e.g., in i. 5. 9. But surely in the present passage one cannot justly find fault either with Xenophon's logic or with his grammar. The general meaning of the sentence is that, although Clearchus saw the crowd which was at the center, and although he had heard from Cyrus that the king was beyond his left wing, still all the same he was unwilling to withdraw the right wing from the river because he feared that he might be surrounded. In other words, Clearchus did not do what at first sight might seem to have been the natural thing to do, namely, make a drive straight at the king, who occupied the center of the Persians. In drawing his troops away from the river he would

have given the Persians an opportunity to surround the Greeks. The long parenthetical sentence is of course equivalent to a modern footnote and has no effect on the construction of the rest of the sentence. If, following Professor Knapp's suggestion, one does not translate *ᾧμως* at all, he will fail to bring out the contrast intended by Xenophon. Although Clearchus was aware of the king's position, yet all the same he was unwilling to make a drive at him and risk being completely surrounded. He even went against the orders of Cyrus in not making at once for the king.

G. C. SCOGGIN

THE UNIVERSITY OF MISSOURI